



OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

Administration Building
10844 Ellis Avenue
Fountain Valley, CA 92708
(714) 593-7433

Agenda Report

File #: 2021-1482

Agenda Date: 2/24/2021

Agenda Item No: 7.

FROM: James D. Herberg, General Manager
Originator: Kathy Millea, Director of Engineering

SUBJECT:

TAFT BRANCH IMPROVEMENTS, PROJECT NO. 2-49

GENERAL MANAGER'S RECOMMENDATION

RECOMMENDATION:

- A. Approve a Professional Design Services Agreement with Woodard & Curran, Inc. to provide engineering services for Taft Branch Improvements, Project No. 2-49, for an amount not to exceed \$2,200,000; and
- B. Approve a contingency of \$220,000 (10%).

BACKGROUND

The Orange County Sanitation District (Sanitation District) owns and maintains regional conveyance facilities in the City of Orange, including the 60-year-old 12 to 18-inch diameter Taft Branch sewer. The Taft Branch runs approximately 13,000 feet from the intersection of Santiago Blvd. and Meats Ave. to the intersection of Batavia St. and Taft Ave.

RELEVANT STANDARDS

- Achieve less than 2.1 sewer spills per 100 miles
- Protect OC San assets
- California Government Code §4526: Select the “best qualified firm” and “negotiate fair and equitable fees”

PROBLEM

The 2019 Master Plan Update (Collections Capacity Evaluation Study) determined the Taft Branch does not have enough capacity under peak wet weather conditions. Additionally, the current sewer alignment has restricted maintenance access where it crosses under the 55 Freeway just south of Meats Ave. and adjacent to residential and Orange County Flood Control properties.

PROPOSED SOLUTION

Award a Professional Design Services Agreement for Taft Branch Improvements, Project No. 2-49. The project will eliminate the current capacity deficiencies and improve maintenance access. The engineering effort will include an evaluation of alternative sewer alignments and construction methods.

TIMING CONCERNS

The schedule driver of this project is to resolve the capacity deficiencies to reduce the risk of potential spills during wet weather events and improve the current restricted maintenance access.

RAMIFICATIONS OF NOT TAKING ACTION

Increased risk of spills during wet weather events due to capacity deficiencies.

PRIOR COMMITTEE/BOARD ACTIONS

N/A

ADDITIONAL INFORMATIONConsultant Selection:

The Sanitation District requested and advertised for proposals for Taft Branch Improvements, Project No. 2-49, on August 27, 2020. The following evaluation criterion were described in the Request for Proposals (RFP) and used to determine the most qualified Consultant.

CRITERION	WEIGHT
Project Understanding and Approach	35%
Related Project Experience	35%
Project Team and Staff Qualifications	30%

Eight proposals were received on October 19, 2020 and evaluated in accordance with the evaluation process set forth in the Sanitation District's Board of Directors Purchasing Ordinance No. OCSD-52 (Purchasing Ordinance) by a pre-selected Evaluation Team consisting of the Sanitation District staff: Senior Engineer (Project Manager), Associate Engineer (Project Engineer), two Engineering Supervisors, and a Maintenance Manager. The Evaluation Team also included one non-voting representative from the Contracts Administration Division.

The Evaluation Team scored the proposal on the established criterion as summarized in the table below:

	Proposer	Project Understanding and Approach (Max. 35 Points)	Related Project Experience (Max. 35 Points)	Project Team and Staff Qualifications (Max. 30 Points)	Total Score (Max. 100 Points)
1	Woodard & Curran, Inc.	27	29	23	79
2	Michael Baker International	25	27	22	74
3	CDM Smith Inc.	22	20	22	64
4	HDR Engineering, Inc.	25	21	18	64
5	Gannett Fleming, Inc.	21	22	20	63
6	GHD Inc.	19	20	17	56
7	Carollo Engineers, Inc.	13	15	13	41
8	Atkins North America, Inc.	10	13	12	35

Following scoring, the five highest-scoring firms were invited for interviews. The interviews were conducted on November 18, 2020. After the interviews, the Evaluation Team determined the highest-scoring proposer based on both the written proposal and the interview. Below is the summary of the final scores.

	Proposer	Project Understanding and Approach (Max. 35 Points)	Related Project Experience (Max. 35 Points)	Project Team and Staff Qualifications (Max. 30 Points)	Total Score (Max. 100 Points)
1	Woodard & Curran, Inc.	32	32	26	90
2	CDM Smith Inc.	27	27	25	79
3	Michael Baker International	25	23	20	68
4	HDR Engineering, Inc.	20	18	16	54
5	Gannett Fleming, Inc.	18	18	17	53

Woodard and Curran, Inc. was selected based on their superior understanding of the goals of the project. The firm presented multiple solutions and conveyed a deep understanding of the hydraulic limitations of the sewer system and the public impacts of the solutions presented. The proposal and interview demonstrated the team's in-depth knowledge of topics such as CEQA approvals for

potential new alignments and constructability risks that were not apparent nor addressed by other proposers. The team members have project experience related to both trenchless and open cut sewer projects that is well suited to the scope and likely challenges of the current project.

Review of Fee Proposal and Negotiations:

Proposals were accompanied by sealed fee proposals. Only the fee proposal of the Evaluation Committee's highest-ranked firm, as approved by the Director of Engineering, was opened in accordance with the Purchasing Ordinance.

Staff conducted negotiations with Woodard and Curran, Inc. to clarify the requirements of the Scope of Work, the assumptions used for the estimated level of effort, and the proposed approach to meet the goals and objectives for the project. Negotiations were held with multiple follow up e-mails and calls. During negotiations, the Scope of Work was reviewed in detail and certain areas were identified that could be adjusted to increase efficiency. The fee decreased due to combining multiple design memos and meetings, reduction in the number of potholes, reduction in the number of design plan sheets, and elimination of additional flow monitoring currently being conducted by the Sanitation District to capture wet weather flows.

	Original Fee Proposal	Negotiated Fee
Total Hours	7,888	5,684
Total Fee	\$2,942,059	\$2,200,000

The Consultant's fringe and overhead costs, which factor into the billing rate, have been substantiated. The contract profit is 8.38%, which is based on an established formula based on the Sanitation District's standard design agreements.

Based on the above, staff has determined that the final negotiated fee is fair and reasonable for the level of effort required for this project and recommends award of the Professional Design Services Agreement to Woodard and Curran, Inc.

CEQA

The Project is included in the 2020 Facilities Master Plan, Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR), State Clearinghouse Number 2019070998. The PEIR was certified by the Sanitation District Board of Directors in December 2020.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

This request complies with authority levels of the Sanitation District's Purchasing Ordinance. This item has been budgeted (Adopted Budget, Fiscal Years 2020-2021 and 2021-22, Section 8, Page 17, Taft Branch Improvements, Project No. 2-49) and the budget is sufficient for the recommended action.

ATTACHMENT

The following attachment(s) may be viewed on-line at the OC San website (www.ocsan.gov) with the complete agenda package:

- Professional Design Services Agreement
- Presentation

RL:dm:gc