
File #: 2022-2428

Agenda Date: 7/27/2022

Agenda Item No: 6.

FROM: James D. Herberg, General Manager
Originator: Kathy Millea, Director of Engineering

SUBJECT:

FAIRVIEW TRUNK SEWER REHABILITATION, PROJECT NO. 6-20

GENERAL MANAGER'S RECOMMENDATION

RECOMMENDATION:

- A. Approve a Professional Design Services Agreement with Dudek to provide engineering services for Fairview Trunk Rehabilitation, Project No. 6-20, for an amount not to exceed \$1,200,000; and
- B. Approve a contingency of \$120,000 (10%).

BACKGROUND

The Fairview Trunk was built in the early 1950s in Fairview Road in the vicinity of the Orange County Fairgrounds in the City of Costa Mesa from Newport Blvd. to Baker Street. Orange County Sanitation District's (OC San) Asset Management Program has identified deterioration over time in this system of vitrified clay pipe and associated manholes.

RELEVANT STANDARDS

- California Government Code §4526: Select the "best qualified firm" and "negotiate fair and equitable fees"
- Protect OC San assets

PROBLEM

An inspection of the Fairview Trunk revealed cracks and fractures in the pipe that have deteriorated over time. In addition, some of the manholes require rehabilitation or replacement and there is also an opportunity to abandon some manholes that are no longer needed for maintenance.

PROPOSED SOLUTION

Approve a Professional Design Services Agreement for Fairview Trunk Rehabilitation, Project No. 6-20. This project will rehabilitate approximately 9,500 feet of 12-inch to 27-inch sewer pipe and associated manholes between the Paularino Channel to the north and Newport Boulevard to the

south in the City of Costa Mesa. Some manholes may be replaced, and others abandoned. The project will require careful coordination with neighbors, businesses, and schools to minimize public impacts.

TIMING CONCERNS

Delaying the approval of this design agreement would delay completion of the project, which would increase the risk that a failure might occur before the work is completed.

RAMIFICATIONS OF NOT TAKING ACTION

Without this project, the pipeline is at risk of failure, which could cause a sewage spill.

PRIOR COMMITTEE/BOARD ACTIONS

N/A

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

Until recently, OC San's sewer model identified the Fairview Trunk as being undersized due to high infiltration and inflow in the area it serves. Costa Mesa Sanitary District, the local sewer agency, has reduced the infiltration and inflow to the point where the line is no longer capacity limited.

Consultant Selection:

OC San issued a request for proposals (RFP) for Fairview Trunk Rehabilitation, Project No. 6-20 on December 21, 2021. The following evaluation criteria were described in the RFP and used to determine the most qualified Consultant.

CRITERION	WEIGHT
Project Understanding and Approach	40%
Related Project Experience	30%
Project Team and Staff Qualifications	30%

Three proposals were received on March 8, 2022 and evaluated in accordance with the evaluation process set forth in OC San's Purchasing Ordinance by a pre-selected Evaluation Team consisting of OC San staff: CIP Project Manager, Senior Engineer, Engineer, Engineering Supervisor, and a Maintenance Supervisor. The Evaluation Team also included two non-voting representatives from the Contracts Administration Division. The Evaluation Team scored the proposal on the established criteria as summarized in the table below:

	Firm	Approach (Max 40)	Related Experience (Max 30)	Team (Max 30)	Total Score (Max 100)
1	Dudek	25	22	22	69
2	GHD	30	20	19	69
3	CDM Smith	31	19	18	68

Based on this scoring, all three Consultants were shortlisted for interviews on March 30, 2022. Following the interview, each member of the Evaluation Team scored the Consultants based on both the proposals and interviews using the evaluation criteria and weighting described above. Based on the scoring shown below, Dudek was selected as the most qualified Consultant.

	Firm	Approach (Max 40)	Related Experience (Max 30)	Team (Max 30)	Total Score (Max 100)
1	Dudek	34	26	25	85
2	CDM Smith	33	21	19	73
3	GHD	28	19	19	66

In the interview, Dudek demonstrated a clear understanding of the project setting, stakeholders, and project goals and objectives, as well as comprehensively describing the approach for each phase of the project. Dudek's interview presentation effectively addressed assigned topics while highlighting the team's highly relevant, related experience and team structure. Their approach, detailed in a project design schedule, indicates early implementation planning and stakeholder buy-in which will mitigate major risks for this project. Therefore, the Evaluation Team determined that Dudek is the most qualified firm to complete the Scope of Work.

Review of Fee Proposal and Negotiations:

Proposals were accompanied by sealed fee proposals. In accordance with OC San's Purchasing Ordinance, the fee proposal of only the highest-ranked firm was opened after approval by the Director of Engineering of the Evaluation Committee's recommendation.

To meet the goals and objectives of the Project, on April 13, 2022 the Evaluation Team began negotiations with Dudek to clarify the requirements of the Scope of Work, the assumptions used for the estimated level of effort, and the proposed approach to meet the goals and objectives. Negotiations included multiple meetings and emails to verify assumptions and level of effort, resulting in a small decrease in the overall level of effort.

The following table summarizes how the estimated level of effort was revised through the negotiations process.

	Original Fee Proposal	Final Fee Proposal
Number of Drawings	41	41
Total Hours	4,858	4,853
Total Fee	\$1,207,109	\$1,200,000

The Consultant's fringe and overhead costs, which factor into the billing rate, have been substantiated. The contract profit is 9.04%, which is based on an established formula for OC San's standard design agreements.

Staff has determined that the final negotiated fee is fair and reasonable for the level of effort required for this project and recommends award of the Professional Design Services Agreement to Dudek.

CEQA

The project is exempt from CEQA under the Class 1 and 2 categorical exemptions set forth in California Code of Regulations Sections 15301 and 15302. A Notice of Exemption will be filed with the OC Clerk-Recorder after OC San's Board of Directors approval of the Professional Design Services Agreement.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

This request complies with authority levels of OC San's Purchasing Ordinance. This item has been budgeted (Adopted Budget, Fiscal Years 2022-2023 and 2023-2024, Section 8, Page 29, Fairview Trunk Sewer Rehabilitation, Project No. 6-20) and the budget is sufficient for the recommended action.

ATTACHMENT

The following attachment(s) may be viewed on-line at the OC San website (www.ocsan.gov) with the complete agenda package:

- Professional Design Services Agreement

VP: iw